

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

We have received your article "Conditioned Medium from Normoxia (WJMScs-norCM) and Hypoxia-Treated WJMScs (WJMScs-hypoCM) in Inhibiting Cancers Cell Proliferation" for consideration for publication in Biomarkers and Genomic Medicine.

Your manuscript will be given a reference number once an editor has been assigned.

To track the status of your paper, please do the following:

1. Go to this URL: <http://ees.elsevier.com/bgm/>

2. Enter the login details

If you need to retrieve password details, please go to:

http://ees.elsevier.com/BGM/automail_query.asp

3. Click [Author Login]

This takes you to the Author Main Menu.

4. Click [Submissions Being Processed]

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Elsevier Editorial System
Biomarkers and Genomic Medicine

from: BGM <bgm.jeo@gmail.com>
sender: ees.bgm.0.2ac792.53bbebfe@eesmail.elsevier.com
date: 24 Jul 2014 12:26:51
To: <wahyu_w60@yahoo.com>
Cc: <bgm.jeo@gmail.com>
subject: Comments for Your Submission BGM-D-14-00024

Ms. Ref. No.: BGM-D-14-00024

Title: Conditioned Medium from Normoxia (WJMScs-norCM) and Hypoxia-Treated WJMScs (WJMScs-hypoCM) in Inhibiting Cancers Cell Proliferation
Biomarkers and Genomic Medicine

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

Your above paper has been reviewed. The reviewers' comments are included below, please carefully address the issues raised in the comments and resubmit the revised manuscript within 14 days.

While you submit a revised manuscript, please outline each change made as raised in the reviewer comments, and/or provide a suitable explanation to the comment that you not addressed.

To submit your revision, please do the following:

1. Go to: <http://ees.elsevier.com/bgm/>
2. Enter your login details
3. Click [Author Login]

This takes you to the Author Main Menu.

4. Click [Submissions Needing Revision]

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely,

Li-Chen Yen, Ph.D.

Managing Editor

Biomarkers and Genomic Medicine

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1:

The manuscript entitled "Conditioned Medium from Normoxia (WJMScs-norCM) and Hypoxia-Treated WJMScs (WJMScs-hypoCM) in Inhibiting Cancers Cell Proliferation" describes the conditioned medium (CM) isolated from hypoxia-treated WJMScs is able to suppress the proliferation of various cancer cell lines. They also found that the expression of surface markers in MSCs is not affected by the CM treatment. Overall the experimental design and data are very

straightforward. The presentation might need lots of work especially the writing and editing. It is also recommended to rephrase the Abstract and check the grammar again.

1. Novelty:

There are several references describe how the MSCs are derived from various sources and their deduced conditional medium are able to support or suppress the tumoral growth. Also, the possible molecular mechanism that regulates the MSC reaction to hypoxic condition has been revealed. Hypoxic MSCs might secret TGF β that interferes the tumor growth/metastasis. These information might help to define the reported studies and they ought to be mentioned in the Introduction or the Discussion sections.

2. Tables and Statistics:

The significances of the Statistic tests need to be labeled on the tables or mentioned clearly in the Result section. There are several minor errors need to be corrected. For example, in Table 1, there are 0.000 or 0.0033 and they should all be four or three digits. What do a, b, c and d stand for in Tables 2 and 3? It is recommended for the authors to read them closely and correct them.

3. Writing:

The Abstract needs to be rephrased. There are several inconsistent writings, for example, Page 6, lines 45-46: "CD 105, CD 73, CD 14, CD 19,, CD 34 and...", which is different from the description on the same page line 30: "CD14, CD19, CD34, CD45 and....". Similar inconsistency needs to be corrected through all the manuscript.

Reviewer #2:

In this study, the authors first characterized that WJMSCs differentiated to osteocyte, chondrocyte, adipocyte under normoxic and hypoxic conditions. They fruther determined the inhibitory effect of WJMSCs-norCM and WJMSCshypoCM on the growth proliferation of several human cancer cells compared to normal cells including mouse fibroblast (NIH3T3) and human fibroblast cells. They found that WJMSCs-norCM and WJMSCs-hypoCM could inhibit cell proliferation in various cancer cell lines, but no growth inhibitory effect on normal cells. Although this study is very preliminary, this is an interesting study that has some potential to be published. However, some points may help to improve the manuscript. For example, some minor typographical errors (like servical (HeLa)..) and need to recheck some paragraph-spacing.

Comments

1. The information of antibodies used in this study should be added in the Material and Methods.
2. NIH3T3, fibroblast and MSC are all belong to plastic fibroblast like cells; however, most cancers are cancers of the epithelial cells. The authors should selected normal epithelial cells to serve as controls.
3. The author should consider performing some experiments like Flow analysis to present the cytotoxic effects of WJMSCs-norCM and WJMSCs-hypoCM on cancer cells in vitro.
4. It will be of great interest to if identify the key factors which mediated the growth inhibition of WJMSCs-norCM and WJMSCs-hypoCM on human cancer cells in vitro.

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

I have successfully received your revision and will proceed further. I will notify you the final decision for your submission at the earliest.

Thank you for your kind cooperation.

Best regards,
LiChen Yen

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

Thank you for your support to BGM.

We have not received the signed copyright transfer agreement (CTA) for the following article yet. Please sign and send them back, and then we will schedule to include it in the regular issue. Thank you.

If you have any question, please feel free to contact me.

Best regards,
LiChen Yen

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

I like to notify you in advance that the holding editor has decided to accept your manuscript which has been well revised. However, before sending the final decision letter to you, we request you to address the following issue.

1. In Discussion, there are several identical paragraphs to other literatures (especially Ref-1&2 marked in the attached CrossCheck report), please rewrite these sentences in your own words.
2. Editorial revision: please see the notations in the attached file [BGM-D-14-00024R1(marked)].

While you complete the revision, please directly send me the manuscript via email and then I will proceed further. Looking forward to hearing from you. Thank you.

Best regards,

LiChen Yen

Managing Editor

Biomarkers and Genomic Medicine

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

Sorry for the late reply.

Thank you for providing the signed CTA. We have scheduled to include this article in BGM Vol. 7 No.1 (March, 2015).

About the correction you request, I am sorry that the author cannot revise the online-published article. In your case, this revision can be made only when I, Editorial Office, provide the correction for the print file. Thus I will assist correcting your article as you request when the issue is compiled.

If you still have any question, please feel free to contact me. Thank you.

Best regards,

LiChen Yen

Dear Dr. Wahyu Widowati,

I knew that you like to revise the Acknowledgment and Reference. But I am sorry that your article has been online-published and cannot be revised anymore at current stage. The only opportunity to revise it is when I correct the final version for print file. The issue vol.7 No.1 will be compiled around February, 2015, so I will correct your article as your request then.

If you have any question, please feel free to contact me. Thank you.

Best regards,
LiChen Yen